

Daf Notes

Insights into the Daily Daf

11 Elul 5766

Sukkah Daf 2

September 4 2006

Visit us on the web at www.dafnotes.blogspot.com

To subscribe, please send email to: Majordomo@eagleintl.com

Highlights

1. There is a debate in the Mishnah regarding a Sukkah that is higher than twenty *amos* (cubits) high. The Chachamim maintain that it is invalid and Rabbi Yehudah maintains that it is valid. A Sukkah that is smaller than ten *tefachim* (handbreadths) or that does not have at least three walls or if there is more sun than shade, it is invalid. (2a1)
2. The Gemara quotes a Mishnah in Eruvin that records a debate regarding a *mavoi* (alleyway) whose *korah*, crossbeam, is higher than twenty amos. The Chachamim maintain that it is not valid and one must lower the *korah* to a height of less than twenty amos and Rabbi Yehudah maintains that one is not required to lower the *korah*. The Gemara offers two reasons why our Mishnah states that the Sukkah is invalid whereas the Mishnah in Eruvin states a remedy for the *korah* that is higher than twenty amos. (2a1-2a2)
3. The Gemara offers various reasons as to why a Sukkah that is higher than twenty amos is invalid. One reason offered is that when one sits in a Sukkah whose *s'chach*, covering, is higher than twenty amos, he is not aware that he is dwelling in a Sukkah, as he does not notice the *s'chach*. A second reason why a Sukkah that is higher than twenty amos is invalid is because when the *s'chach* is higher than twenty amos, one is not sitting in the shade of a Sukkah but in the shade of the walls. A third reason why a Sukkah that is higher than twenty amos is invalid is because it is meant to be a temporary dwelling and a Sukkah whose *s'chach* is higher than twenty amos is a fixed dwelling and is thus invalid. (2a2-2a3)
4. Rabbi Yoshiyah said in the name of Rav that if the walls of the Sukkah reach the *s'chach*, even the Chachamim agree that the Sukkah is valid. The reason it is valid is because we apply the reasoning that ones eyes will travel up the wall and will notice the *s'chach*. (2b1)
5. Rav Huna said in the name of Rav that if the Sukkah is wider than four square amos, even the Chachamim would agree that the Sukkah is valid. The reason it is valid is because we apply the reasoning that the Sukkah is spacious so the shade is coming from the *s'chach*. (2b1-2b2)
6. Rav Chanan said in the name of Rav that if the Sukkah is large enough that it will accommodate more than a person's head, most of his body and his table, even the Chachamim agree that the Sukkah will be valid. (2b3)
7. Rabbi Yehudah offers a proof to his opinion that a Sukkah higher than twenty amos is valid from an incident concerning Queen Helena. The Queen was sitting in a Sukkah that was higher than twenty amos and the elders came to visit her and they did not inform her that her Sukkah was invalid. The Chachamim countered that this incident is not a proof because Helena was a woman and a woman is exempt from the mitzvah of Sukkah. Rabbi Yehudah responded that Helena had seven sons and certainly one of them had reached the age where he would be required to dwell in a Sukkah, and furthermore, Queen Helena was scrupulous in that she performed all her deeds according to the words of the Chachamim. From this it is evident that her Sukkah was valid. (2b3)

Iyunim-Hashkafah

Synthesizing wisdom and insight into knowledge

The Gemara cites a verse as proof that a Sukkah that is higher than twenty amos high is invalid. It is said *so that your generations will know that I caused the Children of Israel to dwell in Sukkos*. The word used for *will know* is *yeidu*. We beseech HaShem in the Shemone Esrei to grant us wisdom, insight and knowledge. *Daas*, knowledge, is a synthesis of wisdom, *Chochmah*, and *binah*, insight. On Rosh Hashanah we are instilled with awe of HaShem, and it is said *the beginning of wisdom is fear of HaShem*. On Yom Kippur we are granted atonement for our sins, and Yom Kippur is the culmination of the Ten

Days of Repentance. The Gemara in Megillah 17b states that the blessing of repentance in the Shemone Esrei follows the blessing of insight, because it is said *and understand with its heart*. Once one has insight, he can truly repent and be granted atonement. Following Yom Kippur is Sukkos, when the wisdom and insight are synthesized in a creation of *daas*, knowledge. This idea can be part of our focus when we dwell in the Sukkah for seven days and contemplate the miracles HaShem has performed for us throughout history.

Iyunim-Halacha

A little bit shady

A Sukkah is designed to provide shade. The Mishnah states that if the sunny area of a Sukkah is greater than its shaded area, the Sukkah is invalid. Rashi explains that the minority of shaded area on the Sukkah floor is negated by the majority of sunny area. The commentators wonder why it was necessary for Rashi to offer this reason. Is it not obvious that a Sukkah that does not have the necessary amount of shade is invalid? Why does Rashi have to mention that the minority of shaded area is negated? The *Eimek Bracha* cites Tosfos here to answer this question. The Gemara states that there are those that maintain that if a Sukkah is higher than twenty amos, but is wider than four square amos, the Sukkah will be valid. Tosfos explains that the Chachamim have established that even if a

Sukkah is more than a thousand amos high, if it is wider than four squared amos, there still will be some shade coming from the *s'chach* into the Sukkah. It is evident from the words of Tosfos that for a Sukkah to be valid, it is required that the Sukkah should provide at least minimal shade. A Sukkah that has a minority of shaded area would be valid if not for the fact that it is negated by the majority of sunny area. Regarding a Sukkah that has a minority of valid shade and there is a majority of shade which is invalid, i.e. when the shaded area is due to the height of the walls, then the Sukkah is valid. The reason for this is because there is a principle that shade cannot negate shade.

Shade at twenty amos

The Chachamim maintain that a Sukkah that is higher than twenty amos is invalid. One of the reasons offered by the Gemara is that one is obligated to sit in the shade of the Sukkah, which refers to the *s'chach*. When the Sukkah is higher than twenty amos, there will be no shade from the *s'chach*. Rather, the shade will be from the walls. *Ritva* wonders about this, because in the middle of the day, when the sun is directly above, the shade will be from the *s'chach* and not from the walls? *Ritva* offers two answers. One answer is that the sun is only directly above in the summer months when

the sun travels in middle of the sky. In the month of Tishrei, however, when the sun is always to the side, there will be no shade from the *s'chach* even in the middle of the day. The second answer of the *Ritva* is that since in the middle of the day the walls do not provide shade, there will also not be any shade from the *s'chach*. The *Aruch LaNer* expresses his bewilderment to this answer, as the reality is that there is shade in the middle of the day. The *Aruch LaNer* offers a means of explaining the answer of the *Ritva*.

Spelling of the word Sukkah

The *Cheishek Shlomo* notes that the word Sukkah is always spelled in the Talmud with the letter *vav*, yet in Scripture the word Sukkah is always spelled without a *vav*. The word *Sukkos* in the plural form, however, is spelled with a *vav*. *Rabbi Chaim Vital* in *Pri Eitz Chaim* and other kabalistic works write that the numerical value of the word *Sukkah* is ninety-one, which is the same numerical value as the two Names of HaShem, *adon-oy* and the *Shem Havayah*. This is true when the word Sukkah is spelled with the letter *vav*. The *Cheishek Shlomo* cites a verse in Tehillim 76:3 where the word *Sukkah* is spelled with a *vav*. It is said *vayehi vesahleim sukko*, which can

be translated to mean *then His Sukkah was complete*, i.e. when the word *Sukkah* equals in numerical value ninety-one, then *umnaso b'tziyon*, the Name of HaShem and His throne will be complete in Zion. The *Cheishek Shlomo* suggests that this is the meaning of the words that we recite in the Friday evening prayers, *haporeis sukkas shalom*, Who spreads the shelter of peace. This shelter of peace alludes to the Gemara in Bava Basra 75 that states that in the future, HaShem will fashion a Sukkah for the righteous.